Supreme Court of Kentucky

OCTOBER 29, 2020 RULINGS

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

110. KENNETH LEE **V.**KENTUCKY DEPARTMENT OF
CORRECTIONS

2018-SC-0403-DG TO BE PUBLISHED LYON

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE HUGHES - AFFIRMING

MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, NICKELL, VANMETER, AND WRIGHT, JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR. LAMBERT, J., NOT SITTING.

Questions Presented:

Criminal Law. KRS 439.3401. Violent Offenders. Opinion of the Court affirming trial court's dismissal of petition for declaration of rights filed by appellant challenging his classification as a "violent offender" under KRS 439.3401 after conviction for first-degree robbery. After review, the Court held that an individual automatically becomes a "violent offender" upon his or her conviction of any crime listed in KRS 439.3401(1); and, further held that the plain language of KRS 439.3401(1) requires a trial court judgment to state if a victim of any crime listed in KRS 439.3401(1)(not only Class B felonies) suffers death or physical injury, if such a finding is supported by the facts of a case.

111. FRANK LASSITER **V.**WILLIAM M. LANDRUM, III

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE LAMBERT - <u>AFFIRMING AND</u>
<u>REMANDING</u>

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2018-SC-0657-DG TO BE PUBLISHED WOODFORD

Questions Presented:

Contracts. Model Procurement Code. Subpoena Power. The Secretary of the Finance and Administration Cabinet has the authority to issue a subpoena to a former state employee, who later became an independent contractor/consultant for a contractor providing fraud detection service while investigating whether the renewal of the contracts for the services violated the Model Procurement Code.

112. CHAZERAE ME'LON TAYLOR, SR. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

2019-SC-0066-MR
TO BE PUBLISHED

FAYETTE

AND

CHAZERAE MEL'ON TAYLOR, SR. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

2019-SC-0138-TG TO BE PUBLISHED **FAYETTE**

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE VANMETER - <u>AFFIRMING</u>

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

Questions Presented:

Wanton Murder. Wanton Endangerment. Directed Verdict. Trial court properly denied directed verdict where there was sufficient evidence for a reasonable jury to conclude that the Defendant knew or should have known that his conduct would render it substantially probable that return gunfire would foreseeably result, placing bystanders at risk of serious physical injury and/or death.

113. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **V.** LEECOLE MITCHELL

2019-SC-0087-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

FAYETTE

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE KELLER - <u>AFFIRMING IN PART,</u> <u>REVERSING IN PART, AND</u> REMANDING

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

Questions Presented:

Criminal Law. Traffic Stops. Dog Sniff. Reasonable Suspicion. Opinion of the Court affirms the Court of Appeals' holding that a traffic stop was impermissibly extended for a dog sniff but reverses that court's holding that it was precluded from reviewing the Commonwealth's argument that the officers had independent reasonable suspicion to search the vehicle.

114. CLIFFORD RUSSELL, SR., ET AL. **V.** JOHNSON & JOHNSON, INC., ET AL.

2019-SC-0118-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **FAYETTE**

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE WRIGHT - REVERSING AND REMANDING

MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, LAMBERT, VANMETER, AND WRIGHT, JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR. NICKELL, J., NOT SITTING.

Questions Presented:

Products Liability. Preemption. Civil Rules. Notice Pleading. The preemption clause contained in 21 U.S.C. § 360(k)(a) does not apply to state claims and causes of action – only state "requirements" for a medical device. Parallel state tort claims are permissible, so long as state tort standards are in harmony with federal regulations. The Court also found Appellants' complaint provided sufficient notice to Appellees of parallel state law claims and was sufficient to survive judgment on the pleadings.

115. BENNY LEE HODGE **V.**COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

2019-SC-0137-TG TO BE PUBLISHED

LAUREL

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE VANMETER - AFFIRMING

MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, LAMBERT, NICKELL, AND VANMETER, JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR. WRIGHT, J., NOT SITTING.

Questions Presented:

Criminal Law. Capital Offense. KRS 422.285, DNA testing. Opinion of the Court affirming the trial court's denial of DNA testing of hair found at victim's home. Proof established beyond a reasonable doubt that Appellant committed two murders, robbery, and burglary and at most DNA evidence would cast some doubt on the testimony of one witness whose testimony is otherwise corroborated. Therefore, DNA evidence in this instance would not result in a more favorable verdict or sentence, nor would it produce exculpatory evidence.

116. BRADY LEE RAY **V.**COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

2019-SC-0164-MR TO BE PUBLISHED

GRAVES

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE LAMBERT - <u>AFFIRMING</u>

ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, LAMBERT, VANMETER, AND WRIGHT, JJ., CONCUR. KELLER AND NICKELL, JJ., CONCUR IN RESULT ONLY.

Questions Presented:

Criminal Law. Motions for Directed Verdict. Trial Procedure. Preservation. Criminal defendants may move for directed verdict on one count of a multiple count indictment without rendering the alleged error unpreserved; defendants are not required to move for directed verdict on any lesser included offenses to a particular charge in order to preserve the issue; and nor are they required to object to instructing the jury on that particular charge to preserve the alleged directed verdict error.

117. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **V.** MICHAEL WAYNE CROWE

2019-SC-0231-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

FAYETTE

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE KELLER - AFFIRMING

MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, LAMBERT, VANMETER, AND WRIGHT, JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR. NICKELL, J. NOT SITTING.

Questions Presented:

Criminal Law. KRS 439.3401(5) Violent Offender Domestic Violence Exemption. Trial court erred in determining that the Defendant was not a victim of domestic violence with regard to the manslaughter. In order to be eligible for the domestic violence exemption under KRS 439.3401(5), the Defendant is required to show that the domestic violence was involved in the commission of the crime or that there was a relationship or connection between the domestic violence and the crime.

118. RICKEY ALLEN RHOTON **V.**COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

2019-SC-0298-DG TO BE PUBLISHED **BATH**

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE KELLER - AFFIRMING

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

Questions Presented:

Criminal Law. Suppression of Evidence. Dog Sniff. Traffic stop was not impermissibly extended where officer discovered an active warrant during a routine outstanding warrant search, resulting in an additional 10-minute delay in processing the Defendant's citation.

119. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES V. K. S., ET AL. 2019-SC-0692-DGE TO BE PUBLISHED

CALLOWAY

OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE LAMBERT - <u>AFFIRMING IN PART AND</u> REVERSING IN PART

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

Questions Presented:

Dependency, Neglect and Abuse. Due Process. KRS 31.110(1)(b). Funding for Expert Assistance. Considering whether expert assistance must be provided to indigent parties in dependency, neglect and abuse cases, KRS 31.110(10(b) does not so entitle an indigent parent to state funded assistance. However, under certain circumstances, parents are entitled to reasonably necessary expert assistance as determined by the trial court on a case-by-case basis.

120.	ARTHUR LONG V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2019-SC-0002-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	LYON
121.	ROBERT PROFFITT V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2019-SC-0173-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	LAUREL
122.	ROBERT FOLEY V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2019-SC-0182-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	LAUREL
123.	GREGORY ESTES V. HON. ANGELA MCCORMICK BISIG, JUDGE, JEFFERSON CIRCUIT COURT, ET AL. MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2019-SC-0335-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	COURT OF APPEALS
124.	MICHAEL R. P'SIMER V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2019-SC-0344-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	CARTER

125. GARY H. COCHRAN V. 2019-SC-0349-MR LAWRENCE COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **NOT TO BE PUBLISHED AND** GARY HAVEN COCHRAN V. 2019-SC-0263-TG LAWRENCE COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY NOT TO BE PUBLISHED **MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - REVERSING AND REMANDING** ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, LAMBERT, AND NICKELL, JJ., CONCUR. WRIGHT, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH VANMETER, J., JOINS. 126. JEREMY BREEDEN V. 2019-SC-0371-MR KENTON COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **NOT TO BE PUBLISHED MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR. 127. BRADLEY ANDERSON V. 2019-SC-0402-MR HARDIN **NOT TO BE PUBLISHED** COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR. 128. CHRISTOPHER A. HILL V. 2019-SC-0571-MR MCCRACKEN **NOT TO BE PUBLISHED** COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE **COURT - AFFIRMING** ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

OPINION AND ORDERS - October 29, 2020

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

L. H., A CHILD UNDER EIGHTEEN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY OPINION AND ORDER - DISMISSING AS MOOT	2019-SC-0321-DG NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	HOPKINS
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.		
CHRISTY HANLEY SHIRCLIFF V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION	2020-SC-0123-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
ORDER OF SUSPENSION FOR ONE YEAR		
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.		
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. ROBERT ANDREW ROWLAND	2020-SC-0228-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
ORDER OF SUSPENSION FOR 180 DAYS		
ALL SITTING. MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, LAMBERT, NICKELL AND WRIGHT, JJ., CONCUR. VANMETER, J., CONCURS IN PART AND DISSENTS IN PART BY SEPARATE OPINION.		
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. LEILA LOUISE HALE	2020-SC-0317-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
ORDER OF PUBLIC REPRIMAND		
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.		
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. HAROLD MCCLURE SCHWARZ, III	2020-SC-0318-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
ORDER OF INDEFINITE SUSPENSION		
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.		
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V . RYAN RICHARD STITH	2020-SC-0320-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
ORDER OF INDEFINITE SUSPENSION		

ORDER GRANTING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW (ORAL ARGUMENT) - October 22, 2020

PAUL KEARNEY, M.D. V. <u>2020-SC-0010-DG</u> FAYETTE

UNIVERSITY OF KENTUCKY

CRAIG BRAMLETT, ET AL. V. <u>2020-SC-0232-DG</u> PIKE

ARNOLD J. RYAN, JR., ET AL.

ORDER GRANTING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW (NO ORAL ARGUMENT) - October 22, 2020

KENTUCKY GUARDIANSHIP <u>2019-SC-0295-DG</u> WHITLEY

ADMINISTRATORS, LLC, AS CONSERVATOR FOR KALI CRUSENBERRY, ET AL. V.

BAPTIST HEALTH SYSTEM, INC. D/B/A BAPTIST

HEALTH CORBIN, ET AL.
NICKELL, J., NOT SITTING.

A. G. V. 2020-SC-0273-DGE JEFFERSON

CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY

SERVICES, COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY,

ET AL.

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. 2020-SC-0279-DG ANDERSON

JAMES PERRY

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW - October 21, 2020

THOMAS STONE, ET AL. V. 2019-SC-0629-D FAYETTE

HOME DEPOT U.S.A., INC. ET AL.

AARON CAMPBELL V. 2019-SC-0727-D FRANKLIN

KEVIN MAZZA

AARON CAMPBELL V. 2020-SC-0074-D FAYETTE

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW - October 21, 2020					
PHILIP ROBERTS, M.D. V. KENTUCKY BOARD OF MEDICAL LICENSURE NICKELL, J., NOT SITTING.	<u>2020-SC-0076-D</u>	JEFFERSON			
ABIGAIL BOARD V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0077-D	JEFFERSON			
GINI G. GRACE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, TRANSPORTATION CABINET, DEPARTMENT OF HIGHWAYS, ET AL.	<u>2020-SC-0079-D</u>	MCCRACKEN			
MICHAEL BROADWAY V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY KELLER, LAMBERT, AND VANMETER, JJ., WOULD GRANT DISCRETIONARY REVIEW.	2020-SC-0086-D	JEFFERSON			
LEXINGTON VILLAGE, LLC V. SHEA CINQUE, ET AL.	2020-SC-0174-D	FAYETTE			
UNIVERSITY OF LOUISVILLE, ET AL. V. STITES & HARBISON, PLLC	2020-SC-0185-D	JEFFERSON			
DAKOTA MILLER V. STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE COMPANY	<u>2020-SC-0190-D</u>	KNOX			
JAMES E. MILLER V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0204-D	HENDERSON			
RENE A. BOUCHER V. RAND PAUL MINTON, C.J., NOT SITTING.	2020-SC-0223-D	WARREN			
HARRY WAYNE SIMPSON, JR. V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0233-D	FAYETTE			

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW - October 21, 2020					
MARYSUSAN WARD V. LOUISVILLE METRO GOVERNMENT	2020-SC-0246-D	JEFFERSON			
B. K. L. V. CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES, COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, ET AL.	2020-SC-0263-DE	GARRARD			
KEITH STURDIVANT V. R.A. JONES & CO., INC.	2020-SC-0265-D	BOONE			
WILLIE L. WHITE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0268-D	KENTON			
HAMILTON HOLDINGS, LTD., ET AL. V. APPALACHIAN ROYALTY TRUST, LLC	2020-SC-0280-D	BELL			
DAVID LEE FINK V. LOUISVILLE/JEFFERSON COUNTY METRO GOVERNMENT, ET AL.	2020-SC-0286-D	JEFFERSON			
ROBERT ROBINSON V . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0287-D	KENTON			
KRISTI CISSELL, ET AL. V. H. L., A MINOR CHILD, ET AL.	2020-SC-0340-DE	MARION			
FRANKFORT PLANT BOARD MUNICIPAL PROJECTS CORPORATION V. BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, LLC D/B/A AT&T KENTUCKY VANMETER J., WOULD GRANT DISCRETIONARY REVIEW.	<u>2020-SC-0344-D</u>	FRANKLIN			
DEJUAN HAMMOND V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2020-SC-0375-D	JEFFERSON			

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW - October 21, 2020

K. H. **V.** <u>2020-SC-0393-D</u> FAYETTE

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW - October 22, 2020

MARK GRAY, ET AL. V. 2019-SC-0626-D MERCER

DAVID BEST, MERCER COUNTY PROPERTY

VALUATION ADMINISTRATOR, ET AL.

EDWARD C. KLEMAN, ET AL. V. 2019-SC-0740-D PULASKI

LAKE CUMBERLAND RESORT COMMUNITY

ASSOCIATION, ET AL.

NICKELL, J., NOT SITTING.

LT. ED ROBINSON, CITY OF MT. VERNON, <u>2020-SC-0019-D</u> ROCKCASTLE

KENTUCKY POLICE DEPARTMENT V. CITY OF MT. VERNON, KENTUCKY, ET AL. LAMBERT AND NICKELL, JJ., NOT SITTING.

COLLINS AND OVEY, S.J., SITTING.

MARVIN TIMOTHY PENNINGTON V. 2020-SC-0147-D FAYETTE

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW AND DEPUBLISHING - October 21, 2020

SCOTT YOUNG V. 2020-SC-0355-D JEFFERSON

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW AND DEPUBLISHING - October 22, 2020

J. FOX DEMOISEY, ET AL. V. 2018-SC-0337-D JEFFERSON

PETER L. OSTERMILLER

LAMBERT, J., NOT SITTING.

ORDER DENYING DISCRETIONARY REVIEW AND ORDERING PUBLICATION - October 22, 2020

DONALD MORGAN, ET AL. V. 2019-SC-0686-D ALLEN

ALLEN COUNTY, KENTUCKY, ET AL.

ORDER DISMISSING - October 15, 2020

KMART V. <u>2020-SC-0290-WC</u> IN SUPREME

PEGGY COFFEY, ET AL. COURT

ORDER DISMISSING

ORDER DISMISSING - October 26, 2020

DAWN GENTRY, JUDGE, KENTON FAMILY <u>2020-SC-0362-OA</u> IN SUPREME CIRCUIT COURT, DIVISION 5 **V.** COURT

JUDICIAL CONDUCT COMMISSION

ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO DISMISS

KELLER, LAMBERT, NICKELL, AND VANMETER,

JJ., SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ORDER AS TO RECONSIDERATION - October 29, 2020

SEAN M. MAGUIRE V. 2018-SC-0290-D HOPKINS

JAMES WILLIAM CROOK

ORDER DENYING RECONSIDERATION

MINTON, C.J.; HUGHES, KELLER, LAMBERT, VANMETER, AND WRIGHT, JJ., SITTING. ALL

CONCUR. NICKELL, J., NOT SITTING.

GEOFFREY M. YOUNG V. 2019-SC-0625-I FAYETTE

ADAM EDELEN, ET AL.

ORDER DENYING RECONSIDERATION

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ORDER DENYING - October 29, 2020

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY V. JASON 2019-SC-0599-CL WARREN

BOWLES

ORDER DENYING REQUEST TO CERTIFY THE

LAW

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ORDER DENYING - October 29, 2020

SAMANTHA KILLARY V. <u>2020-SC-0073-T</u> JEFFERSON

LINDA THOMPSON, ET AL.

ORDER DENYING TRANSFER

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

DENNIS DOLAN, ET AL. V. <u>2020-SC-0212-T</u> JEFFERSON

LOUISVILLE/JEFFERSON COUNTY METRO

SEWER DISTRICT (MSD), ET AL.

ORDER DENYING TRANSFER

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ORDER VACATING AND DISMISSING - October 29, 2020

MICAH C. SCHOETTLE V. COMMONWEALTH 2018-SC-0498-MR KENTON

OF KENTUCKY

ORDER VACATING AND DISMISSING AS MOOT

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ORDER WITHDRAWING FROM KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION - October 19, 2020

CYNTHIA ANNE POWELEIT V. 2020-SC-0504-KB IN SUPREME

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION COURT

SANA HASSAN V. 2020-SC-0505-KB IN SUPREME

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION COURT